



**The Real  
Pennsylvania Dutch American,  
"Molly Pitcher"**

**A Short History**

**by Robert C. Goodyear,  
Great, Great, Great Grandson of  
Mary Ludwig "Molly Pitcher" Hays**

**Hans Georg Ludwick arrived in Philadelphia aboard the ship Osgood, on September 29, 1750, with his wife, Anna Margretha Wildt. Records show that he was a butcher, and had two children, Martin and Maria.**

**His daughter Maria Ludwick (or Mary Ludwig) was born in or near Philadelphia, probably in Bucks County, PA, on October 13, 1754.**

*(Copies of these documents are in my possession)*

**So, she was born of immigrant German parents, and was in no way “Irish.”**

**Mary (or Molly) first married Irishman Casper Hays. A document in the Pennsylvania Archives shows that a marriage license was issued on July 24, 1769, and they were married the next day at St. Michael's and Zion Church in Philadelphia, PA.**

*(Copies of these documents, obtained from The Godfrey Library, Middletown, CT, are in my possession)*

**Early researchers looked for a man named Hays in records of the Battle of Monmouth, and discovered a man named John Hays, an Infantryman. They assumed that Casper Hays and John Hays were the same person, and for many years, Molly's husband was believed to be John Casper Hays. Molly was never married to a man named John Hays.**

**After the early death of Casper, she married William Hays, an Irishman who lived in Bristol, PA, just a few short miles north of Philadelphia. As was common in those times, William was most likely Casper's brother. The Hays family would have been responsible for Molly's welfare.**

**Molly was 15 years old when she first married. At that young age, it is only natural that she would pick up Irish words, phrases and somewhat of an accent from her husbands.**

**In 1883, Wesley Miles published an article regarding his *memories* of Molly Pitcher. Over 50 years after Molly's death, he recalls that Molly spoke with an Irish brogue. He was 6 or 7 years old when he knew her, and most likely would not have known an Irish brogue from a German accent.**

**Additionally, statements that Molly spoke with an Irish brogue could not possibly be true, since 99% of the Irish population at that time were Scots-Irish and spoke with a Scottish accent.**

**William Hays first enlisted in the Army in his home town of Bristol, Pennsylvania, on May 10, 1777.**

*(Copies of William Hays' military records, obtained from the National Archives, are in my possession)*

**During the battle of Monmouth, June 28th, 1778, with temperatures approaching 100 degrees, the wife of William Hays, by then a Gunner Private of Proctor's 4th Artillery, was carrying water in a pitcher (or more likely, a bucket) to the soldiers, and to cool the blazing cannons. For this service, they called her "Molly Pitcher." During the battle, her husband was struck down, and the cannon was ordered to be withdrawn. She immediately seized the rammer and continued to assist in serving the cannon until the battle ended.**

**At the close of the war she went with William to Carlisle, PA, where they acquired Lot #257. A Plan of Carlisle shows this property.**

*(A copy of this plan, obtained from the Cumberland County Historical Society, is in my possession)*

**The Tax Rate books from 1783 show that William owned, "1 House & Lot," and that he was a Barber.**

**Their only child, Johanes (*otherwise known as John*) Ludwig Hays, was born in 1783.**

**In the 1785 Tax Rate Books, William Hays is shown as owning;**

**"1 House and Lot Rented**

**1 Ditto his own**

**1 Cow"**

*(Copies of these Tax Rate documents, obtained from the Cumberland County Historical Society, are in my possession)*

**William Hays died in 1787. His burial place is unknown with certainty, although a stone bearing only the name "Hays" can be found in the Old Graveyard in Carlisle.**

**In 1778, Molly appeared before the Orphans Court, to sell a portion of William Hays' Land to support her son, John Hays, and to pay taxes on said property. The Court approved this sale.**

*(A copy of this document, obtained from the Cumberland County Historical Society, is in my possession)*

**She then married John McCalley (McCalla).**

**The 1800 US Census shows that in his household lived;**

**1 male age 45 or older (John McCalley),**

**1 female age 45 or older (Molly),**

**and 1 female under the age of 10.**

**This female child could possibly be the illegitimate child of John Ludwig Hays, Elizabeth Hays, whose descendants have contacted me. John Ludwig Hays was not living with them, and there is no record of where he did live.**

*(A copy of this document, available at [Ancestry.com](http://Ancestry.com), is in my possession)*

**On April 15-17, 1807, John McCalla, Molly, and her son John were forced to sell the remainder of the property left to her by William Hays for the sum of Thirty Dollars to James Brady of Greensburgh, Westmoreland County, PA.**

*(A copy of this document, obtained from the Cumberland County Historical Society, is in my possession)*

**The 1810 Federal Census shows that John McCauley (McCalley, McCalla) had died, and Mary "McColley" was shown as Head of Household.**

*(A copy of this document, available at [Ancestry.com](http://Ancestry.com), is in my possession)*

**On October 31, 1816, Molly's granddaughter Sarah Jane Hays was born. Records of the First Evangelical Lutheran Church, Vol.1, page 14, now housed at the Lutheran Theological Seminary, Gettysburg, PA, show that Sarah's father was Johanes Hays. This is further proof that Molly was German and not Irish. William Hays and his "Irish" wife would never have used a German name for their son. However, a German mother would.**

**It has also been documented that Molly, herself, attended the Lutheran Church in Carlisle, as did most Germans of the time, and not the Presbyterian Church, as did most Irish.**

*(A copy of this document, obtained from the Cumberland County Historical Society, is in my possession)*

**Molly survived her third husband many years, known as Molly McCauley (or McKolly), and the statements so frequently made that Molly Pitcher was a young Irish woman also originated from this name. When it was suggested that she was Irish, a reply would be, "No, she was Dutch as sauerkraut; her maiden name was Mary Ludwig!"**

**Johanes Ludwig Hays, his wife Elizabeth Reinhardt Hays, their 7 children, and his mother, Molly, lived near the southeast corner of North and Bedford Streets in Carlisle.**

**The following extract from *the American Volunteer*, February 21, 1822, not only shows what was done by the State, but also shows that at a time when many were living who could have disputed the facts, the general statements in regard to Molly's history were accepted.**

*"A bill has passed both Houses of the Assembly granting an annuity to Molly McCauly (of Carlisle) for services she rendered during the Revolutionary war. It appeared satisfactorily that this heroine had braved the hardships of the camp and dangers of the field with her husband, who was a soldier of the revolution, and the bill in her favor passed without a dissenting voice. -Chronicle.<sup>99</sup> (A copy of this Act of the Assembly, obtained from the Pennsylvania Archives, is in my possession)*

**According to the records at Harrisburg, no application was made for Molly's pension after January 1, 1832, a fact corroborative of 1832 as the year of her death.**

*(A copy of the Payment Ledger, obtained from the Pennsylvania Archives, is in my possession)*

**The 1830 Census shows that John's mother was living with him then, and until her death on Sunday, January 22, 1832, and is listed as being between 70 and 80 years old, therefore having been born between 1750 and 1760. This also proves that her birth year was 1754 and not 1744, as is so widely claimed.**

*(A copy of this document, available at Ancestry.com, is in my possession)*

**From the CARLISLE AMERICAN VOLUNTEER;**

*"Died on Sunday last in this borough, at an advanced age, Mrs. Molly McCauley. She lived during the days of the American Revolution, sharing its hardships, and witnessed many scenes of blood and carnage. To the sick and wounded she was an efficient aid Mary had one child, a son by her first marriage, who served as a soldier in the war of 1812."*

**The Reverend Joseph A. Murray, of Carlisle, later added an important detail to the death notice;**

*"Very distinctly do I remember her son, John L. Hays," he said. "The initial L is for Ludwig. He was named after his maternal grandfather. He was tall and straight and was called Sergeant Hays, as he occupied that position in the old infantry company"*

Molly's descendants, all by William Hays, were highly respectable citizens of Carlisle.

Her son, Johannes Ludwig Hays, died in Carlisle in 1853, and was buried with military honors for his service during the War of 1812.

Johanes' sons, William R. Hays, George R. Hays (*my Great Grandfather*), John A. Hays, (*who was street commissioner in 1883*), and Frederick R. Hays, lived in Carlisle. His daughters included, Polly Hays McCleester, who lived at Papertown, Mt. Holly Springs, PA, Sarah Jane Hays, and Elisa Hays.

Polly remembered her grandmother very well, and at age 81 unveiled the first memorial to Molly Pitcher, cut by Peter Spahr, and erected in the "Old Graveyard" at Carlisle. It bore the following inscription:

**MOLLIE McCAULY**  
*Renowned in history as*  
**MOLLIE PITCHER**  
*The Heroine of Monmouth*

---

*Died Jan 1833*  
*aged 79 years.*  
*Erected by the Citizens of*  
*Cumberland County*  
*July 4, 1876.*

Molly's age and the year of her death on this headstone were incorrect for a time, but were corrected several years later. Mr. Spahr had known Molly's birth year was indeed 1754, and mis-cut the headstone to reflect that date

The first true memorial to Molly was unveiled on June 28, 1905, the 127<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the Battle of Monmouth, and was placed by the Patriotic Order Sons of America.. They erected a flagpole, and placed a cannon with the barrel over Molly's grave. The carriage of this cannon bore a metal plate with the inscription;

*"Erected in memory of*  
*Mollie McKolly*  
*renowned in history as*  
*Mollie Pitcher,*  
*by the P.O.S. of A. of Cumberland*  
*County, 1905."*

*(An account of this event, largely ignored by researchers, is available in a booklet entitled, "A Short History of Molly Pitcher," at the Cumberland County Historical Society, an original copy of which is in my possession)*

A few years later, the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania appropriated funds, and in 1916, a large Monument was erected near Molly's grave. A slightly larger than life-size statue of Molly stands atop this Monument. The face of Molly on this statue is said to be a composite of the faces of five great grandchildren, including my grandmother, Anna Hays Goodyear.

The year of her birth on this Monument remains incorrect.

Every marker or monument of any kind erected by the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania uses the name Ludwig as a part of Molly's name.

At Monmouth Battlefield State Park in New Jersey, is a wayside marker which claims that Molly was a "plucky Irish water carrier."

This marker must be removed or replaced.



In 2000, the United States Field Artillery Association, in conjunction with their "Historian for the Molly Pitcher Project," a Mrs. Constance M. McDonald, whose husband was Assistant Commandant of the U.S Army Field Artillery School, and Deputy Commanding General of Fort Sill, Oklahoma, were instrumental in erecting a stone and bronze "History Corrected" marker near the base of the 1916 Memorial Monument to Molly in the Old Graveyard, Carlisle, PA, and is based on faulty research by Carlisle "historian" Merri Lou Schaumann, who refuses to discuss Molly Pitcher with me.

The marker, which desecrates Molly's gravesite, boldly claims, presenting no proof whatsoever, that; "THE NAME "LUDWIG" IS NOT ASSOCIATED WITH MOLLY PITCHER."

This marker must be removed or replaced.



The following Notarized affidavit, though not actually proof in the eyes of some "revisionist scholars," indicates that Molly's maiden name was, in fact, Mary Ludwig.

*"State of Pennsylvania,  
County of Cumberland,  
ss:*

*Before me, a Notary Public in and for said State and County, personally appeared Mary E. Wilson, who, after having been by me duly sworn according to law, doth depose and say that she is now 48 years old and resides in Carlisle, where she has lived all her life, and that she is the daughter of Frederick McCleaster, who was the son of John and Polly McCleaster, the said Polly McCleaster being the daughter of John Hays, who was the son of Molly McKolly, otherwise known as "Molly Pitcher," whose maiden name was Mary Ludwig.....*

*etc.*

*Witnessed my hand this 13th of Aug., 1903 (Signed) Mrs. Mary E. Wilson.  
Sworn and subscribed before me this 13th of Aug., 1903. (Signed) John R. Miller"*

*I certify that the foregoing affidavit  
was made before me at the time  
and place stated.*

  
NOTARY PUBLIC,  
CUMBERLAND CO., PA.  
My Comm. Expires April 10, 1907.

*(Signature image provided by the Cumberland County Historical Society)*

**On June 5, 1984, my 2nd cousin, Ella Marie Kramer Bender became the first woman ever accepted into the Daughters of the American Revolution (DAR) using Mary Ludwig "Molly Pitcher" as her Patriot Ancestor.**

*(A "Record Copy" of Mrs. Bender's DAR Application, obtained from the DAR, is in my possession)*

**On August 9, 2007, I became the first man accepted into the Sons of the American Revolution using Mary Ludwig Hays as my Patriot Ancestor.**

**Unless primary documentation is furnished proving that Molly's maiden name was something other than Ludwig, this writer shall not allow history to be changed.**

**I am certain that no such documentation exists.**

**June 2008**

## Epilogue

I have spent months sending letters, and sending my full manuscript, which includes images of all of the documents cited in this pamphlet, to the Mayor and to the Borough Council of Carlisle, PA, and to the United States Army Military History Institute. Also there was also invaluable help in letters sent by Siegfried Bette of the Steuben Society of America, and Clark D. McCullough, President of the Monmouth Chapter of the Sons of the American Revolution, as well as additional help from Robert McKnight, a Past President of the Monmouth Chapter of the SAR.

As a result, two major goals have been reached.

The official History of the United States Army now shows that “Molly Pitcher” was Mary Ludwig Hays McCauley, the wife of Gunner William Hays, at the Battle of Monmouth, June 28, 1778.

On April 7, 2008, I was personally informed by Mr. Kirk Wilson, the Mayor of the Borough of Carlisle that the “History Corrected” marker will be removed.

He said that, “...since the name on the (1916) Monument was deemed to be correct at its dedication, there is no reason now to assume it is incorrect. “

By June 28, 2008, the 230<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the Battle of Monmouth, the removal of the marker should be completed, and Molly Pitcher’s gravesite should be restored to near its original 1916 appearance.

There is still much work to be done to correct the blatantly false “revisionist” versions of the story of Molly Pitcher.

However, this pamphlet is being distributed in an attempt to dispel that hoax forever.

Molly Pitcher was German, not Irish.

And her true name was Mary Ludwig Hays.



## About the Author



**Robert Charles Goodyear was born on August 17, 1945, in Abington, Pennsylvania.**

**Upon his 1963 graduation from William Tennent High School in Warminster, PA, he enlisted in the United States Navy.**

**After a 24 year career in the Navy he returned to his home in Warminster, and served another 11 years as a civilian government employee at a nearby Naval Air facility, in technical photography and telecommunications, and then in San Diego, California, before finally returning to Warminster to retire.**

**In 1991, Robert began researching his family's genealogy, and can trace his ancestry back to the Gutjahr surname in Merseberg, Sachsen (Germany), in 1652.**

**He had known since childhood that he was a great, great, great grandson of Mary Ludwig "Molly Pitcher" Hays.**

**He also discovered that his grandfather, Ezra Goodyear, though he was born and lived near Carlisle, Pennsylvania, fought with the 8<sup>th</sup> Illinois Cavalry Volunteers during the Civil War.**

**Robert is a member of the Sons of Union Veterans of the Civil War (SUVCW), the Patriotic Order Sons of America (POSoFA), and on August 9, 2007, became the first man ever accepted into the Sons of the American Revolution (SAR), using Mary Ludwig Hays as his Patriot Ancestor. He is a member of the New Jersey Society, Monmouth Chapter.**

For full copies of this pamphlet, which include images of all of the documents cited, please contact;

Robert C. Goodyear  
18 Jamison Street  
Warminster, PA 18974

[bob@goodyear-mascaro.org](mailto:bob@goodyear-mascaro.org)